



City Council Memorandum

To: Mayor Fasbender & City Council Members
From: Justin Fortney, City Planner
Date: November 6, 2023
Item: Award Contract - City Hall Dome Roofing Project – Renaissance Roofing, Inc.

COUNCIL ACTION REQUESTED

Council is requested to consider adoption of the attached resolution awarding the City Hall dome roofing project to Renaissance Roofing, Inc., and authorized execution of the contract.

BACKGROUND INFORMATION

As part of the larger City Hall repair project, this dome roofing portion was the most difficult to procure a bid. The project was advertised three times and appeared on the city’s website, construction data networks, and was directly sent to roofing firms. Multiple firms attended some or all three pre-bid walkthroughs. Miller Dunwiddie, the project architecture firm amended the proposal each time to reduce any possible bidder apprehension.

We finally received a bid from Renaissance Roofing, Inc. from Belvidere, Illinois. They had not bid the first two times citing a busy workload at the time.

<u>Bidder</u>	<u>Total Base Bid</u>
Renaissance Roofing, Inc.	\$3,294,805

In addition to the base bid, an alternate bid was required for repair and gilding of the center dome and finial. It was originally gilded and subsequently painted a gold color as the gilding likely reached the end of its life. The gold paint has now faded and flaked. They can be repainted to last about 15 years. They may also be repaired and gilded again with a lifespan of 30 or more years. The appearance of exterior rated gold paint and gilding are not the same. Gold is shiny and reflective as opposed to the paint only having a similar hue. Repainting is included in the base bid. The alternate to repair and gild the top dome and finial is \$9,990.

POST-BID CONTRACTOR QUALIFICATION REVIEW

Renaissance Roofing, Inc. submitted several recent project references from the Midwest, along with four recent industry journal articles highlighting some of the projects. Feedback received was positive. One of the references was an architect specializing in this type of work who said, Renaissance is the only specialized firm in the Midwest that routinely performs this work. She added that there are a handful on the east coast who will work this far west, but only if work is slow. Review feedback notes are attached.

PROPOSED CONSTRUCTION SCHEDULE

The project will take time due to the nature of the work and the heights involved. Renaissance proposes to begin the project this winter with investigation, sample harvesting, and establishment of an off-site

sheet metal production shop. Scaffolding would be installed on the main dome early spring and finally removed from the corner domes July 2025. IX-03

STAFF RECOMMENDATION

Staff is recommending that the City Council adopt the attached resolution awarding the contract to Renaissance Roofing, Inc. in the amount of \$3,294,805.

Repairing and gilding the top dome and finial as they were designed is the best preservation practice and will last twice as long as repainting. The cost of \$9,990 to repair and gild them again is considerable. However, so will the cost to have it repainted in 15-years without scaffolding in place.

ATTACHMENTS

- Resolution – Award Contract
- Review Feedback Notes
- Reference Notes – Center Dome and Finial photos

CITY OF HASTINGS
DAKOTA COUNTY, MINNESOTA
RESOLUTION NO. _____

RESOLUTION RECEIVING BIDS AND AWARDING CONTRACT FOR THE 2023 CITY HALL DOME ROOF PROJECT

WHEREAS, pursuant to an advertisement for bids for the City Hall Dome Roof Project, where bids were opened on August 30th, 2023 at 2:00 p.m. as advertised and tabulated according to law, and the following bids were received by the deadline:

<u>Bidder</u>	<u>Total Bid</u>
Renaissance Roofing, Inc.	\$3,294,805

and

WHEREAS, the city’s consultant architect and city staff have sufficiently researched Renaissance Roofing, Inc. and past project references as the lowest qualified bidder, and found they have performed similar work with the proficiency required, and

WHEREAS, it appears that Renaissance Roofing, Inc. is the lowest valid responsible bidder.

NOW, THEREFORE BE IT RESOLVED BY THE CITY COUNCIL OF THE CITY OF HASTINGS AS FOLLOWS:

1. Award the contract to Renaissance Roofing, Inc. in the amount of \$3,294,805
2. The Mayor and Clerk are authorized to execute a contract with Renaissance Roofing, Inc.

ADOPTED BY THE CITY COUNCIL OF HASTINGS, MINNESOTA, THIS 6TH DAY OF NOVEMBER, 2023.

Ayes:

Nays:

ATTEST:

Kelly Murtaugh, City Clerk

Mary Fasbender, Mayor

SEAL

Highlight Summary

1. Very high quality of work, dedication to the projects, and obvious interest in the longevity of the work being done.
2. There were no concerns with change orders other than one project but seemed minor. (see Martin County Courthouse below). There was not a long list or a pattern of them.
3. There were no reports of disruptions to building operations, although the buildings did look unique for some time with scaffolding all over.
4. The project foremen and individual employees were very respectful.
5. The quality of the work was flawless, and no corrections were noted.
6. Staging areas were kept neat and of limited size on compact sites. However, they were generally used for the duration of the long projects.
7. The project timing followed schedule, unless supplies were delayed or became unavailable.

Based on the feedback I received, it appears the company is very capable of the work and very professional. I have no reservations about working with them.

Mississippi County Courthouse – Osceola/ Judge John Alan Nelson

They were a very good company to work with.

There were no impacts to building employees or operations.

There were no unnecessary or overpriced change orders, they are not that kind of company.

The quality of work was exceptional.

We were happy with the completion date and the project timeline, given unforeseen circumstances. When the roofing was removed, fire damage was found and a lot of framing repairs were required, which impacted completion date.

Martin County Courthouse Dome/ Scott Higgins (Owner Rep)

Excellent company great to work with

Fantastic workmanship

A can-do approach from the foreman and the workers very pleasant.

Very dedicated employees that were working every day and all winter long.

They seemed to work hard to avoid additional expenses or to absorb them if possible.

They made plaster repairs for all roof leaks during construction. Not related to the dome, but the main roof was concrete and in very poor shape.

There were a few change orders, mostly for the main roof. The one that sticks out regarding the dome was for asbestos tar removal from the dome framing in order for the company to copy it for duplication. The owners felt the contractor or architect should have known. (I'm not so sure, but there could have been more to it.)

Cascade County Courthouse / Paul Filicetti, AIA (Architect) A&E Design | Missoula

They showed genuine interest in the finished product's long-term longevity.

He would definitely recommend working with them.

There were project delays due to the manufacturer not being able to produce material fast enough.

There were no contentious change orders.

They had excellent communication and were very responsive.

They were open to determining many specifications when the drawings and provided specs lacked necessary detail.

Fort Leavenworth Building 52 Copper Bell Tower/ Julia Manglitz, AIA (Architect) Older project from 2011.

Owner reps from the project were very seasoned at the time and have all retired or passed.

I think very highly of them and have even hired them to assist on structural assessments since working with them on that project.

That project was a positive experience for her firm and she believes the owners as well.

IX-03
They are the only specialized firm in the Midwest that perform this work. There are a good handful on the east coast who will work this far west, but only if work is slow. I recently worked on a dome project in Kansas where a different contractor had a decent portfolio of historic projects. When it came time to do a mock-up, it was apparent they didn't have a clue and it became a difficult job to get through. There is a major pipeline issue of qualified contractors for specialized work. The trade organizations have realized that all the educational programs are only preparing workers for the current trade techniques and are not capable of working on past systems. Some companies have started looking for quality untrained employees that they will train themselves to produce the wide variety of knowledge necessary in the real world. She hopes the educational programs can be retooled to meet the needs of the real world.

